

1 MELINDA BIRD (SBN 102236)
2 MARILYN HOLLE (SBN 61530)
3 DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA
4 3580 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 902
5 Los Angeles, CA 90010
6 Telephone: (213) 427-8747
7 Facsimile: (213) 427-8767
8 melinda.bird@disabilityrightsca.org
9 marilyn.holle@disabilityrightsca.org

6 *Attorneys for Named Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*
7 *Additional Attorneys for Named Plaintiffs and the*
8 *Proposed Class on Signature Page*

8 STEPHEN P. BERZON (SBN 46540)
9 EVE H. CERVANTEZ (SBN 164709)
10 STACEY M. LEYTON (SBN 203827)
11 PEDER J. THOREEN (SBN 217081)
12 RACHEL J. ZWILLINGER (SBN 268684)
13 Altshuler Berzon LLP
14 177 Post Street, Suite 300
15 San Francisco, California 94108
16 Telephone: (415) 421-7151
17 Facsimile: (415) 362-8064
18 sberzon@altshulerberzon.com
19 ecervantez@altshulerberzon.com
20 sleyton@altshulerberzon.com
21 pthoreen@altshulerberzon.com
22 rzwillinger@altshulerberzon.com

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs SEIU-UHW, SEIU-ULTCW, SEIU*
17 *Local 521, SEIU California State Council, UDW, and CUHW*

18 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
19 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
20 SAN FRANCISCO/OAKLAND DIVISION

20 DAVID OSTER, *et al.*,) Case No.: CV 09-04668 CW
21)
22 Plaintiffs) **INDEX OF DECLARATIONS IN**
23) **SUPPORT OF *EX PARTE* APPLICATION**
24 v.) **FOR TEMPORARY RESTRAINING**
25) **ORDER AND ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE**
26 WILL LIGHTBOURNE, Director of the) **WHY PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION**
27 California Department of Social Services;) **SHOULD NOT ISSUE**
28 TOBY DOUGLAS, Director of the California)
Department of Health Care Services;)
CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH)
CARE SERVICES; and CALIFORNIA)
DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SERVICES,)
Defendants)

Index of Declarations

CASE NO. CV 09-04668 CW

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

NAMED PLAINTIFFS

DOCKET NO.

1. M.G. re: L.C. (includes Exh. A) (provider to 6-year-old daughter, 58 hours of IHSS per month, metabolic disorder called MSUD, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 352

2. Andrea Hylton (second declaration; includes Exh. A) (Santa Barbara County, 65-year-old recipient, 45 hours of IHSS care per month, emphysema, osteoarthritis, severe depression, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 371

3. Dottie Jones (third declaration; includes Exh. A) (Nevada County, 53-year-old recipient, 46.5 hours of IHSS care per month, AIDS, neuropathy, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 374

4. David Oster (third declaration; includes Exh. A) (Los Angeles County, 61 hours of IHSS care per month, autism, bipolar disorder, DD waiver, likely will qualify for Care Supplement)..... 390

5. Michelle Rivera re: C.R. (third declaration; includes Exh. A) (Santa Clara County, provider to 7-year-old son, 160 hours of IHSS care per month, chromosome deletion, DD waiver, likely will qualify for Care Supplement) 395

6. Helen Polly Stern (includes Exh. A) (Shasta County, 86-year-old recipient, 121 hours of IHSS care per month, bilateral dysplasia, osteoarthritis, osteoporosis, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 401

7. Charles Thurman (includes Exh. A) (Shasta County, 71-year-old recipient, 31 hours of IHSS care per month, diabetes, neuropathy, emphysema, legally blind, heart disease, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 404

IHSS RECIPIENTS AND PROVIDERS

1. Gerald Aho (third declaration; includes Exhs. A-B) (Los Angeles County, 62-year-old recipient, 33.8 hours of IHSS care per month, bipolar disorder, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 337

2. Trina Cachero re: Teresa King (includes Exh. A) (Calaveras County, provider to 33-year-old sister, 84 hours of IHSS care per month, schizoaffective, PTSD, major depressive disorder, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 355

3. Paul Cline (includes Exh. A) (Santa Barbara County, 56-year-old recipient, 34.6 hours of IHSS care per month, degenerative disc disease, arthritis, diabetes, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 343

 a. Leonard Woods (provider to Paul Cline) 414

4. Susan Cooper (includes Exh. A) (Solana County, 59-year-old recipient, 50.5 hours of IHSS care per month, bipolar disorder, high blood pressure, diabetes, arthritis, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 345

Index of Declarations

CASE NO. CV 09-04668 CW

1 a. Eulalia Carpenter (provider to Susan Cooper and Roxanna White)..... 342

2 5. Vicki Goff (includes Exh. A) (Santa Barbara County, 56-year-old recipient, 71.4 hours of

3 IHSS care per month, bipolar disorder, PTSD, suicidal ideations, degenerative disc disease,

4 bursitis, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 354

5 a. Susan Meireles (provider to Vicki Goff)..... 384

6 6. Maria Gonzalez (includes Exh. A) (Alameda County, 64-year-old recipient, 153.8 hours of

7 IHSS care per month, blind as a result of glaucoma, high blood pressure, hyperthyroidism,

8 obesity, kidney disease, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 357

9 7. Joseph Guerin re: Jacqueline Guerin (includes Exh. A) (Los Angeles County, provider to

10 52-year-old mother, 93.8 hours of IHSS care per month, developmentally age of 8- or 9-

11 year-old, obesity, trouble with responding to mail, likely will qualify for

12 Care Supplement) 361

13 8. Sheela Gunn-Cushman (Alameda County, 40-year-old recipient, blind, cerebral palsy,

14 diabetes, asthma, seizure disorder, cannot reliably access printed documents) 363

15 9. Dale Hammers (includes Exh. A) (Shasta County, 79-year-old recipient, 68 hours of IHSS

16 care per month, legally blind, partially paralyzed, likely will not qualify for Care

17 Supplement)..... 364

18 a. Eillen Goulet (provider to Dale Hammers) 359

19 10. James Hayes (includes Exh. A) (San Joaquin County, 75-year-old recipient, 77 hours of

20 IHSS care per month, prostate cancer, asthma, emphysema, Alzheimer’s disease,

21 depression, illiteracy, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 366

22 a. Donna Baker (provider to James Hayes and Virginia Salazar)..... 338

23 11. Skyla Hicks (includes Exh. A) (Santa Barbara County, 55-year-old recipient, 50 hours of

24 IHSS care per month, degenerative disc disease, arthritis, nerve issue, respiratory

25 problems, urinary leakage, high blood pressure, depression, likely will not qualify for Care

26 Supplement)..... 367

27 12. Mildred Hutchens (includes Exh. A) (Santa Clara County, 74-year-old recipient, 103 hours

28 of IHSS care per month, severe arthritis, fibromyalgia, high blood pressure, likely will not

qualify for Care Supplement) 370

13. Janice Lott (includes Exh. A) (Santa Clara County, 59-year-old recipient, 136 hours of

IHSS care per month, hepatic encephalopathy, spinal stenosis, chronic acute double-sided

sciatica, chronic colitis, anemia, depression, PTSD, likely will not qualify for Care

Supplement)..... 379

a. Ruth Cunningham (provider to Janice Lott)..... 348

14. Thomas Love (second declaration; includes Exh. A) (Los Angeles County, 48-year-old

recipient, 40 hours of IHSS care per month, schizophrenia, bipolar disorder, migraines,

insomnia, high cholesterol, thyroid problem, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)

..... 380

Index of Declarations

CASE NO. CV 09-04668 CW

1 15. Bruce Maher (includes Exh. A) (Sonoma County, 59-year-old recipient, 100 hours of IHSS
2 care per month, terminal, advanced-stages emphysema, lung and bladder cancers, unable to
3 use thumbs, PTSD, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 381
4 16. Joyce McHenry (third declaration; includes Exh. A) (Sonoma County, 61-year-old
5 recipient, 591 hours of IHSS care per month, severe clinical depression, anxiety disorder,
6 panic attacks, suicidal ideations, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 383
7 a. Ilse Schemel (provider to Joyce McHenry)..... 399
8 17. Irma Jean Mills (includes Exh. A) (Tulare County, 66-year-old recipient, 155 hours of
9 IHSS care per month, type II bipolar disorder, dyslexia, degenerative disc disease, asthma,
10 severe psoriasis, cannot reliably respond to mail, likely will qualify for Care Supplement)
11 386
12 18. Miguel Moreno (includes Exh. A, translation) (Fresno County, 76-year-old recipient, 65.8
13 hours of IHSS care per month, diabetes, kidney failure, arthritis, high blood pressure, high
14 cholesterol, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement) 387
15 a. Yolanda Milian (translation) (provider to Miguel Moreno)..... 385
16 19. Duong Nguyen (includes Exh. A, translation) (Orange County, 91-year-old recipient, 72
17 hours of IHSS care per month, Alzheimer’s disease, high blood pressure, lack of calcium,
18 hard of hearing, monolingual Vietnamese speaker) 388
19 20. J.O. re: R.L. (includes Exh. A) (provider to 16-year-old son, 78.7 hours of IHSS care per
20 month, Friedreich’s Ataxia Dystrophy, likely will not qualify for Care Supplement).... 389
21 21. Katie Phillips re: Alexander Soto (includes Exh. A) (San Luis Obispo County, provider to
22 44-year-old son, 85.8 hours of IHSS care per month, paranoid-schizophrenia, depression,
23 likely will not qualify for Care Supplement)..... 393
24 22. Virginia Salazar (includes Exh. A) (San Joaquin County, 70-year-old recipient, 59 hours of
25 IHSS care per month, heart failure, diabetes, bursitis, obesity, arthritis, likely will not
26 qualify for Care Supplement) 398
27 a. Donna Baker (provider to James Hayes and Virginia Salazar)..... 338
28 23. John Swann (includes Exh. A) (Shasta County, 75-year-old recipient, 78 hours of IHSS
care per month, spinal stenosis, depression, likely will not qualify for Care
Supplement)..... 402
a. Julie Warner (provider to John Swann)..... 410
24 24. Gustavo Uriarte (includes Exh. A, translation) (Contra Costa County, 84-year-old
25 recipient, 79 hours of IHSS care per month, stroke survivor with inhibited mobility,
26 diabetes, high cholesterol, high blood pressure, likely will not qualify for Care
27 Supplement)..... 405
28 a. Maria Ramirez Perez (translation) (provider to Gustavo Uriarte)..... 391
25 Eugene Wessinger (includes Exh. A) (Sonoma County, 61-year-old recipient with 43.8
hours of IHSS care per month, stroke survivor with inhibited mobility and edema, impaired

Index of Declarations

CASE NO. CV 09-04668 CW

1 breathing, cardio vascular disease, rheumatoid arthritis, prostate problems, likely will not
 2 qualify for Care Supplement) 411
 3 a. Sharon Peterson (provider to Eugene Wessinger)..... 392
 4 26. Roxanne White (includes Exh. A) (Solano County, 52-year-old recipient, 40 hours of IHSS
 5 care per month, AIDS, cervical cancer survivor, high blood pressure, stroke and coma
 6 survivor, heart problems, inhibited mobility, asthma, circulation problems, likely will not
 7 qualify for Care Supplement) 412
 8 a. Eulalia Carpenter (provider to Susan Cooper and Roxanne White)..... 342

8 **EXPERTS, COUNTY OFFICIALS, AND STAKEHOLDERS**

9 1. Elena Ackel (second declaration) (Los Angeles County, Senior Attorney in the
 10 Governmental Benefits Units of the Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles) 336
 11 2. Margaret Baran (second declaration) (San Francisco County, Executive Director of the
 12 IHSS Consortium) 339
 13 3. Kerry Bargsten (Sonoma County, IHSS Social Worker) 340
 14 4. Charles Calavan (Alameda County, Executive Director of the IHSS Public Authority) 341
 15 5. Leland Collins (third declaration; includes Exh. A) (San Luis Obispo County, Director of
 16 Department of Social Services) 344
 17 6. John Cottrell (includes Exhs. A-B) (Contra Costa County, Director of Department of
 18 Aging & Adult Services) 346
 19 7. Kathryn L. Crain (Los Angeles County, Licensed Clinical Social Worker for the
 20 Department of Mental Health)..... 347
 21 8. Karen D’Antonio (Sonoma County, IHSS Social Worker III)..... 350
 22 9. Mike Danekker (Los Angeles County, Executive Director of Westside Regional
 23 Center) 349
 24 10. Megan Elliott (San Francisco County, Program Director of IHSS Program in the
 25 Department of Aging and Adult Services) 351
 26 11. Michael Gause (San Francisco County, Associate Director of the Mental Health
 27 Association of San Francisco) 353
 28 12. Sue Good (second declaration; includes Exh. A) (Butte, Colusa, Glenn, Tehama, and
 Plumas Counties, Paralegal at Butte Regional Office of Legal Services of Northern
 California)..... 358
 13. Anne Guerra (third declaration) (Nevada County, Executive Director of Nevada-Sierra
 Regional IHSS Public Authority) 362

1 14. David Hathaway (second declaration) (Alpine County, IHSS referrals and assessments,
 2 Department of Health and Human Services)..... 365
 3 15. Shirley Ann Hoffaker (second declaration) (Los Angeles County, Supervisor of Case
 4 Management at the Assistance League of Southern California’s Hollywood Senior
 5 Multipurpose Center)..... 368
 6 16. Gavin Huntley-Fenner, Ph.D. (includes Exhs. 1-3) (national expert in fields of cognitive
 7 psychology and human factors)..... 369
 8 17. Sandra Izsadore (Los Angeles County, Social Worker, IHSS Department) 372
 9 18. Dionne Jimenez (second declaration; includes Exhs. A-H) (Research Coordinator for the
 10 Service Employees International Union (SEIU)) 373
 11 19. Diane Kaljian (third declaration) (Sonoma County, Director, Adult and Aging Division of
 12 the Human Services Department)..... 375
 13 20. Karen Keeslar (second declaration; includes Exh. A) (Executive Director, California
 14 Association of Public Authorities for IHSS (CAPA))..... 376
 15 21. Mitch LaPlante (second declaration; includes Exh. A) (University of California, San
 16 Francisco, Professor, Department of Social and Behavioral Sciences and Institute for
 17 Health and Aging, national expert on disability policy)..... 377
 18 22. Ernesto Lopez (Fresno County) (Social Worker, IHSS Services and Adult Protective
 19 Services (retired)) 378
 20 23. Therese Marconi (Crockett) (second declaration) (San Joaquin County, Manager, IHSS
 21 Programs) 382
 22 24. James Preis (includes Exh. A) (Los Angeles County, Director of Mental Health Advocacy
 23 Services) 394
 24 25. Lisa Rosene (second declaration) (Chief, Regional Center Services)..... 396
 25 26. Frances Smith (Yolo County, Director of IHSS Services Public Authority) 400
 26 27. Greg Thompson (Los Angeles County, Executive Director, Personal Assistance Services
 27 Council) 403
 28 28. Norma Vescovo (second declaration) (Executive Director, Independent Living Center of
 Southern California) 406
 29 29. Gary Voice (San Luis Obispo County, Director of Finance and Administration, United
 Domestic Workers of America (UDW), AFSCME Local 3930) 407
 30 30. Steven P. Wallace (includes Exhs. A-B) (University of California, Los Angeles, Professor
 and Chair of Community Health Sciences, School of Public Health)..... 409
 31 31. Kim Williams (second declaration) (Los Angeles County, Paralegal, Family Caregiver
 Project of BetTzedek Legal Services) 413

Index of Declarations

CASE NO. CV 09-04668 CW

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF DECLARATIONS

1. Elena Ackel 336

2. Gerald Aho 337

3. Donna Baker (re: James Hayes and Virginia Salazar) 338

4. Margaret Baran 339

5. Karry Bargsten..... 340

6. Trina Cachero (re: Teresa King)..... 355

7. Charles Calavan 341

8. Eulalia Carpenter (re: Susan Cooper and Roxanne White) 342

9. Paul Cline 343

10. Leland Collins 344

11. Susan Cooper 345

12. John Cottrell 346

13. Kathryn Crain 347

14. Ruth Cunningham (re: Janice Lott) 348

15. Mike Danekker 349

16. Karen D’Antonio 350

17. Megan Elliott 351

18. M.G. (re: L.C)..... 352

19. Michael Gause 353

20. Vicki Goff..... 354

21. Maria Gonzalez 357

22. Sue Good 358

23. Eileen Goulet (re: Dale Hammers) 359

24. Joseph Guerin (re: Jacqueline Guerin) 361

25. Ann Guerra 362

26. Sheela Gunn-Cushman 363

27. Dale Hammers 364

28. David Hathaway 365

29. James Hayes 366

30. Skyla Hicks..... 367

31. Shirley Ann Hoffacker 368

32. Gavin Huntley-Fenner 369

33. Mildred Hutchens 370

34. Andrea Hylton 371

35. Sandra Izsadore 372

36. Dionne Jimenez 373

37. Dottie Jones 374

38. Diane Kaljian..... 375

39. Karen Keeslar 376

40. Mitch LaPlante 377

41. Ernesto Lopez 378

42. Janice Lott 379

43. Thomas Love 380

1 44. Bruce Maher 381
 2 45. Therese Marconi (Crockett) 382
 3 46. Joyce McHenry 383
 4 47. Susan Meireles (re: Vicki Goff) 384
 5 48. Yolanda Milian (re: Miguel Moreno) 385
 6 49. Irma Jean Mills 386
 7 50. Miguel Moreno 387
 8 51. Duong Nguyen 388
 9 52. J.O. re: R.L 389
 10 53. David Oster 390
 11 54. Sharon Peterson (re: Eugene Wessinger) 392
 12 55. Katie Phillips (re: Alexander Soto) 393
 13 56. James Preis 394
 14 57. Maria Ramirez Perez (re: Gustavo Uriarte)..... 391
 15 58. Michelle Rivera (re: C.R) 395
 16 59. Lisa Rosene 396
 17 60. Virginia Salazar 398
 18 61. Ilse Schemel (re: Joyce McHenry) 399
 19 62. Frances Smith 400
 20 63. Helen Polly Stern 401
 21 64. John Swann 402
 22 65. Greg Thompson 403
 23 66. Charles Thurman 404
 24 67. Gustavo Uriarte 405
 25 68. Norma Vescovo 406
 26 69. Gary Voice..... 407
 27 70. Steven Wallace 409
 28 71. Julie Warner (re: John Swann) 410
 72. Eugene Wessinger 411
 73. Roxanne White 412
 74. Kim Williams 413
 75. Leonard Woods (re: Paul Cline)..... 414

Dated: December 1, 2011

Respectfully Submitted,

By: /s/ Melinda Bird
 MELINDA BIRD (SBN 102236)
 MARILYN HOLLE (SBN 61530)
 DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA
 LOS ANGELES REGIONAL OFFICE
 3580 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 902
 Los Angeles, CA 90010
 Telephone: (213) 427-8747
 Facsimile: (213) 427-8767
melinda.bird@disabilityrightsca.org
marilyn.holle@disabilityrightsca.org

Index of Declarations

CASE NO. CV 09-04668 CW

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

SUJATHA JAGADEESH BRANCH (SBN 166259)
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA
SACRAMENTO REGIONAL OFFICE
1831 K Street
Sacramento, CA 95811
Telephone: (916) 504-5800
Facsimile: (916) 504-5801
sujatha.branch@disabilityrightsca.org

DARA L. SCHUR (SBN 98638)
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA
BAY AREA REGIONAL OFFICE
1330 Broadway, Suite 500
Oakland, CA 94612
Telephone: (510) 267-1200
Facsimile: (510) 267-1201
dara.schur@disabilityrightsca.org

PAULA PEARLMAN (SBN 109038)
SHAWNA PARKS (SBN 208301)
DISABILITY RIGHTS LEGAL CENTER
919 Albany Street
Los Angeles, CA 90015
Telephone: (213) 736-1031
Facsimile: (213) 736-1428
paula.pearlman@lls.edu
shawna.parks@lls.edu

CHARLES WOLFINGER (SBN 63467)
LAW OFFICE OF CHARLES WOFLINGER
4655 Cass Street # 314
San Diego, CA 92109
Telephone: (858) 272-8115
Facsimile: (858) 270-3960
Cw@charleswolfinger.com

JANE PERKINS (SBN 104784)
NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM
211 N. Columbia Street
Chapel Hill, NC 27514
Telephone: (919) 968-6308
Facsimile: (919) 968-8855
perkins@healthlaw.org

ABIGAIL K. COURSOLE (SBN 266646)
NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM
3701 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 750
Los Angeles, CA 90010
Telephone: (310) 736-1652
Facsimile: (213) 368-0774
coursolle@healthlaw.org

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

ANNA RICH (SBN 230195)
NATIONAL SENIOR CITIZEN LAW CENTER
1330 Broadway, Suite 525
Oakland, CA 94612
Telephone: (510) 663-1055
Facsimile: (510) 663-1051
arich@nsclc.org

*Attorneys for Individual Named Plaintiffs David
Oster, Willie Beatrice Sheppard, C.R., Dottie Jones,
Andrea Hylton, Helen Polly Stern, Charles Thurman,
L.C., and the Plaintiff Class*

By: /s/ Stacey M. Leyton
STEPHEN P. BERZON (SBN 46540)
EVE H. CERVANTEZ (SBN 164709)
STACEY M. LEYTON (SBN 203827)
PEDER J. THOREEN (SBN 217081)
RACHEL J. ZWILLINGER (SBN 268684)
Altshuler Berzon LLP
177 Post Street, Suite 300
San Francisco, California 94108
Telephone: (415) 421-7151
Facsimile: (415) 362-8064
sberzon@altshulerberzon.com
ecervantez@altshulerberzon.com
sleyton@altshulerberzon.com
pthoreen@altshulerberzon.com
rzwillinger@altshulerberzon.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs SEIU-UHW, SEIU-ULTCW,
SEIU Local 521, SEIU California State Council,
UDW, and CUHW*